



**DRAFT
REGULAR MEETING
THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2006
PLAN REVIEW CONFERENCE ROOM
7447 EAST INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD
SCOTTSDALE, AZ**

PRESENT: Ed Wimmer, Chair
George Hartz, Vice-chair
Paul Winslow, Commissioner
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner
Nancy Dallett, Commissioner
Kathy Howard, Commissioner

STAFF: Debbie Abele, HPO
Don Meserve, Preservation Planner
Ian Johnson, Intern

OTHER: Karen LaFond, Resident
Gerard LaFond, Resident
David Schmidt, Architect
Alex Bethlee, ASU Student
Jodey Elsner, ASU Student
Rachel Simmons, ASU Student
Esther Kozinets

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:35 p.m.

1. Introductions and Roll Call

A roll call confirmed the members present as stated above.

2. Minutes: August 10, 2006

COMMISSIONER WINSLOW MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 10, 2006 MEETING, AS WRITTEN. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

3. Public Hearing Item: Initiation of HP Overlay Zoning Case for Charles Miller House; Located at 6938 East 1st Street; Owned by Zebra Family Trust; Richard A. Funke, Trustee

Ms. Abele stated that after discussion at the last meeting, it was agreed that the process for formally listing the property on the Scottsdale Historic Register be started. The first formal step is initiation and there will be no discussion about the merits of the property at this time. If approved, this action will officially begin the process and start the notice, posting, and various other activities associated with an HP overlay zoning case. Mr. Meserve noted that Richard A. Funke was notified that the potential initiation of an HP case for his property was on the agenda.

Chair Wimmer called for public comment; there was none.

COMMISSIONER HOWARD MOVED TO INITIATE AN HP OVERLAY ZONING CASE FOR THE CHARLES MILLER HOUSE, LOCATED AT 6938 EAST 1ST STREET. COMMISSIONER WINSLOW SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).

4. Report: Update on Taliesin West Special Campus Rezoning by Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation

Ms. Abele distributed copies of a letter she sent to the new director outlining the previous agreement and commitments between the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation (Foundation) and the HPC. The director replied that he would make a presentation to the Commission at the October meeting. This presentation will include a full update and the Foundation's plans for the future.

Mr. Meserve provided an explanation to the citizens present that some core buildings on approximately 10-2/3 acres at Taliesin West, designed by Frank Lloyd Wright and owned by the Frank Lloyd Wright Foundation, had been designated in April 2006 by the City Council as a Historic Property (HP) overlay zoning district and placed on the Scottsdale Historic Register.

Commissioner Dallett proposed that, after the October presentation, a time frame be suggested to the Foundation within which a Special Campus (SC) rezoning application goes forward or the Commission should re-open the HP rezoning issue.

5. Discussion/Possible Action: Window Replacement Policies for Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation (HRER) Program Applications (continued from 8/10/06)

Mr. Johnson indicated that he had spent a great deal of time gathering information, including visiting window manufacturers' showrooms and speaking with their representatives, viewing internet sites, reviewing city documents and HPC preservation guidelines, and doing library research in order to develop a window replacement policy. He distributed a draft policy, which was designed to start a conversation at this meeting.

Mr. Johnson indicated that criteria had been developed based on Commission suggestions—looking at issues of durability, energy efficiency, and appearance. The criteria are subdivided into two groups—required and desired. Under the proposal, applicants to the HRER Program would have to meet the required criteria.

In his research, Mr. Johnson found that any material would meet the required guidelines. Energy Star rated most aluminum products as not being energy efficient; however, they did rate aluminum-clad wood as energy efficient. Vinyl has problems with cracking, yellowing, sagging,

and chalking—but this has to do mainly with the quality of the windows and vinyl. However, Mr. Johnson did not recommend that the Commission eliminate certain materials for use.

Mr. Johnson reviewed and provided additional information on the draft policy. He brought sample materials from vendors, and photos of existing and replacement windows to the meeting for examination by meeting participants.

Ms. Abele added that third-party certifications were also obtained, rather than relying on the information provided by salespeople.

Commissioner Winslow opined that the Commission should encourage HRER applicants to consider window materials that have more longevity than vinyl.

Chair Wimmer asked Mr. Johnson if he had any comments on the vinyl window issue.

Mr. Johnson stated that if the Commission rules out aluminum and vinyl, there are only two other options—fiberglass and wood. Fiberglass can be painted, and has a better warranty, structural integrity, and durability than vinyl. Vendors state that vinyl does not stand up as well as fiberglass. The fiberglass comes with a 20-year guarantee; Mr. Johnson was not able to find a comparable guarantee for vinyl.

Vice-chair Hartz stated he would not be in favor of having an exclusive list of materials, sources, and brands or excluding vinyl.

Commissioner Lockwood stated that in many meetings she has attended with green building and product people and builders, the discussion of vinyl had come up many times. Builders dislike it and it is warranted for ten years rather than 20 years for the other products. She opined that if the Commission is providing funding, that it should recommend that vinyl would not be in anyone's best interest.

Ms. Abele informed the Commission that ten years was the typical life of the city's interest in the property through the Conservation Easement.

Commissioner Winslow suggested that the degree of energy efficiency might be out of the purview of the Commission and that the most important aspects of the windows should be appearance and durability.

More discussion ensued on the elements of the proposed policy. Commissioners supported requiring grilles/muntins on the exterior of any replacements windows on the front façade and did not support windows with grilles/muntins between the panes on the front of the house.

Ms. Abele stated that, in response to a Commission inquiry, she had found that steel-casement windows are not salvageable because they are embedded in the block surrounding them; hence they are not worth anything once removed.

Ms. Abele stated it was up to the Commission to set policy. This window policy should be a guide for applicants so that the process is more efficient. An applicant who is doing a repair will automatically be ranked higher than one who is doing a replacement.

Commissioner Winslow directed staff to re-draft the proposed window policy to include the changes recommended in today's meeting and present it to the Commission at the next meeting for action. Staff was also asked to compare warrantees and costs.

6. Review/Possible Action: Additional Recommendations on June 1, 2006 HRER Applications

Commissioner Winslow suggested that staff contact these applicants, give them an overview of the policy recommendations with the assumption that during the next month they could begin to modify their proposals to be approved or disapproved at the next meeting.

Ms. Abele stated that cost implications could be presented to the Commission at that time as well. She reminded the Commission that this did not need to go before the City Council and the Commission had the final approval for funding rehab projects. HRER applications will be placed on the agenda for the October meeting.

7. Report /Discussion: October 6-7, 2006 Green Building Expo Preparation

Ms. Abele indicated that Commissioner Dallett asked staff to get a booth at the Expo to demonstrate HPC's commitment to green building practices.

Mr. Meserve reported that a booth for the HPC had been reserved for the Expo. He requested assistance in coverage of the booth and discussed items that will be available for handouts at the booth. The Expo will be open from 10:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. on Friday October 6, and from 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. on Saturday October 7 at the Scottsdale Center for the Arts.

Commissioner Lockwood informed the group that the Expo program was going to include articles. She submitted an article today on maintaining Scottsdale's historical past, but greening it for the future.

Vice-chair Hartz opined that the handouts should not be limited to green building practices, but information on the historic preservation program should be available as well. All agree.

8. Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion

- **Community Outreach Committee**

Vice-chair Hartz indicated that the Committee had recently met and had the following recommendations for the 2007 Work Program:

- ◆ Neighborhood brochures - Each neighborhood historic district should have its own brochure.
- ◆ Time frames and an approach for some of the events that have been done in the past, such as moving the walking tour up several months (January - March) when the weather is better and there are more visitors.
- ◆ Sponsor a community event in 2007 in conjunction with the tenth anniversary of the Commission and timed with Preservation Month. Suggest to staff that a more elaborate than usual annual report be prepared to celebrate the anniversary.
- ◆ Plan ahead for a ranch forum in cooperation with *Atomic Ranch* magazine.
- ◆ Prepare signage that celebrates the fact that the City of Scottsdale/HPC is funding or partially funding the exterior rehabilitation projects (Staff is proceeding with this proposal).
- ◆ In conjunction with HPC's archeology responsibility, co-sponsor an event with the McDowell Sonoran Conservancy, such as a hike to the Brown's Ranch area. Time it to coincide with Arizona Archeological Month events (March 2007).

- **Historic Register Committee**

Commissioner Howard indicated the committee had met several times during the summer and finished a matrix that chronologically lists sites with comments and status on each. The Watch List matrix is on a CD and was given to Mr. Meserve.

Mr. Meserve suggested the Watch List be placed on a future Commission agenda.

Chair Wimmer recognized Commissioner Howard who will be leaving the Commission at the end of her term. He thanked her for all her work and dedication.

9. Report/Discussion: HPO/Staff Report and Announcements

Ms. Abele stated that when the potential neighborhoods for designations were resurveyed, it was discovered that Cavalier Vista 3 and 4 no longer had a sufficient number of contributing homes. Work on Sherwood Heights had been postponed pending resolution of a lawsuit. A decision was made to review the larger list of higher-ranked 1950s neighborhoods to find substitutes.

There are three 1950s neighborhoods that staff would like the Commission to consider as candidates for designation, with a field trip planned for later in the fall to look at them. They are Arcadia Square, Whitwood, and McDowell Parkway. There are no character ranch neighborhood candidates for the 1950s. Ms. Abele suggested that the Historic Register Committee look at the 1960s' character ranch neighborhoods as a complement to other historic neighborhoods.

Mr. Meserve noted that the Scottsdale Town Hall event is coming up in November and distributed information from the city's website on this event.

Ms. Abele added that the Fifth Avenue presentation should be completed and come out before the Scottsdale Town Hall.

10. Commissioner Comments, Public Comments, and Announcements

Chair Wimmer recognized Commissioner Winslow, architect who will also be leaving the Commission at the end of his term. He thanked him for all his work, dedication, and wisdom regarding architectural issues.

Chair Wimmer announced the resignation of Commissioner Hatathli, archaeologist. This vacancy must be filled by another archeologist to meet local and state Certified Local Government (CLG) requirements. Ms. Abele indicated she is checking on whether the archeologist must be registered since it is difficult to find certified archaeologists living in Scottsdale.

Chair Wimmer noted that there are a series of ongoing workshops on the City's Code of Ethics and each Commissioner must attend one of them.

Commissioner Lockwood suggested that an item be added to an upcoming agenda encouraging homeowners to inspect their insulation rather than replace windows in order to make their homes more energy efficient. These homes are not very energy efficient because of lack of insulation and adding more insulation might alleviate the need for window replacement. Mr. Meserve concurred with this suggestion and noted that staff has begun considering energy audits for sample homes in the historic districts.

Chair Wimmer called for public comments.

Mr. LaFond stated that it was frustrating for the homeowner to hear that the window replacement policy would be tabled for another month. He wanted to see a uniform recommendation made as quickly as possible. He indicated that some of the windows in his home were not operational.

He stated that in his conversations with three window vendors, who gave bids for window replacement, aluminum frames were the best with regards to meeting exactly the current architectural look. Vinyl frame windows were recommended because they were the best in regards to cost and energy efficiency. Wooden frame windows were not recommended by any of the three entities based on cost and lack of durability in the desert. Mr. LaFond recommended that the cost issue be added to the window replacement policy, in that \$10,000 would not go very far if he was forced to go with the high-end windows.

Chair Wimmer reminded Mr. LaFond that only the windows that are visible from the street would fall under the highest standards.

Commissioner Lockwood stated that there are Federal tax-break programs for installing energy efficient products. She indicated that the Commission is looking out for the homeowner in that it is not energy or resource efficient to install windows that have to be replaced and put in the landfill in ten years.

Mr. LaFond stated that Milgard has a lifetime guarantee on vinyl frame windows and seven years if you sell the house.

Chair Wimmer agreed with Mr. LaFond about the cost and it will be factored into the policy. He suggested that Mr. LaFond work with staff to modify his application for replacement windows so that it could be acted upon at the next meeting.

Ms. LaFond stated that she was pleased that they actually found someone to exactly duplicate the windows, but the frames were aluminum.

Ms. Abele responded that discussions would be conducted with each homeowner regarding the appropriateness and circumstances of their window replacements.

11. Future Meetings and Agenda Items

Agenda items were previously discussed and identified.

12. Adjournment

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 7:12 p.m.

Respectfully submitted, A/V Tronics, Inc.